

1 Barrett S. Litt, SBN 45527  
2 Email: blitt@kmbllaw.com  
3 KAYE, MCLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT  
4 975 East Green Street  
5 Pasadena, California 91106  
6 Telephone: (626) 844-7660  
7 Facsimile: (626) 844-7670

8 Carol A. Sobel, SBN 84483  
9 Email: carolsobel@aol.com  
10 LAW OFFICE OF CAROL A. SOBEL  
11 725 Arizona Avenue, Suite 300  
12 Santa Monica, California 90401  
13 Telephone: (310) 393-3055

14 ADDITIONAL COUNSEL LISTED  
15 ON NEXT PAGE  
16 Attorneys for Plaintiffs

17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
18 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

19 CHARMAINE CHUA, ET AL.

20 PLAINTIFFS,

21 VS.

22 CITY OF LOS ANGELES, ET AL.,

23 DEFENDANTS.

CASE No: 2:16-cv-00237-JAK-GJS(x)  
[HON. JOHN A. KRONSTADT]

[PROPOSED] PRELIMINARY APPROVAL  
ORDER; EXHIBITS

HEARING DATE: SEPTEMBER 9, 2019

HEARING TIME: 8:30 A.M.

COURTROOM: 10B

1 ADDITIONAL PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL

2 Paul Hoffman, SBN 71244

3 Email. hoffpaul@aol.com

4 Catherine Sweetser, SBN271142

5 Email. catherine.sdshhh@gmail.com

6 SCHONBRUN, SEPLOW, HARRIS & HOFFMAN

11543 Olympic Boulevard

Los Angeles, California 90064

7 Tel. (310) 396-0731

8 Fax. (310) 399-7040

9 Colleen M. Flynn, SBN 234281

10 Email. cflynnlaw@yahoo.com

11 LAW OFFICE OF COLLEEN FLYNN

3435 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 2910

12 Los Angeles, California 9001 0

13 Tel. 213 252-9444

14 Fax. 213 252-0091

15 Matthew Strugar, SBN 232951

16 Email. matthewstrugar@gmail.com

17 LAW OFFICE OF MATTHEW STRUGAR

2108 Cove Avenue

18 Los Angeles, California 90039

19 Tel: 323 696-2299

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 The parties have submitted this joint Preliminary Approval Order of the  
 2 Class Settlement for the Court's review. Upon review and consideration of the  
 3 Settlement Agreement (Exhibit A hereto) (the "Settlement Agreement") and the  
 4 exhibits attached thereto made and entered into by counsel for the parties, who  
 5 represent that their respective clients have approved the settlement.

6 The Named Plaintiffs/Class Representatives are Charmaine Chua, Torie  
 7 Rivera, and Lydia Hicks. Kyle Todd is an individual Named Plaintiff (for a  
 8 different but related incident than that involving the Class Representatives and the  
 9 class they represent). The Defendants are the City of Los Angeles, former Los  
 10 Angeles Police Chief Charlie Beck, LAPD Commander Andrew Smith, and LAPD  
 11 Captain Jeff Bert. This action arises out of the alleged unlawful detention and  
 12 arrest of individuals engaged in demonstrations at or near the intersection of 6th  
 13 and Hope Streets on November 26, 2014. Plaintiffs allege that the police herded  
 14 Plaintiffs as they marched, finally trapping and surrounding them, preventing them  
 15 from moving forward on the sidewalk. Plaintiffs also allege that, by kettling and  
 16 arresting them without first issuing a lawful order to disperse, Defendants violated  
 17 Plaintiffs' rights under the U.S. and California constitution, as well as their  
 18 statutory and common law rights. Plaintiffs further allege that their arrest was  
 19 without lawful basis, and that Defendants denied the class members release on  
 20 their own recognizance ("OR release") without an individual determination.

21 While Defendants continue to dispute the validity of Plaintiffs' allegations,  
 22 the parties have agreed to enter into this Settlement Agreement to avoid the mutual  
 23 risks of litigation.

24 **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED THAT:**

25 **I. PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT**

26 1. This Order incorporates by reference the definitions in the Settlement  
 27 Agreement, a copy of which is attached to this Order as Exhibit A, and also  
 28 incorporates Exhibits B and C, thereto. All terms defined therein shall have the

1 same meaning in this Order.

2       2. The Settlement Agreement is hereby preliminarily approved, subject  
3 to further consideration thereof at the Fairness Hearing provided for below. The  
4 Court finds that the class damages fund of \$255,010 (inclusive of expert and  
5 mediation costs, class administration costs of \$20,000, payments to claiming class  
6 members of a total of \$200,000 and \$5000 incentive awards to each of the three  
7 named plaintiffs); \$484,290 (inclusive of litigation costs other than the expert,  
8 mediation and class administration costs) as compensation for statutory attorneys'  
9 fees and costs; and \$5000 to Todd Kyle individually are within the range of what  
10 would constitute a fair, reasonable, and adequate settlement in the best interests of  
11 the Class as a whole, and that the terms of the Settlement Agreement otherwise  
12 satisfy the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 23(e) and due process requirements.

13 **II. DEADLINES FOR NOTICE, FILING OBJECTIONS AND OPT-**  
14 **OUTS, AND DATE OF FAIRNESS HEARING**

15       3. The Court has set the following dates for purposes of this class action:

16       (a) Final class identifying information, to the extent not already provided,  
17 will be provided to Class Administrator Law Office of Carol Sobel no  
18 later than September 9, 2019;

19       (b) September 23, 2019: Text message, emailing and first-class mail  
20 notice (for those for whom email addresses and mobile phone  
21 numbers are unavailable);

22       (c) September 30, 2019: Notice by regular mail to all class members who  
23 were initially notified by electronic means only (those who received  
24 notice by email and text) and who have not yet submitted claim forms  
25 along with the explanation that they were sent such electronic notice  
26 but this notice is being sent as well because they did not file a claim  
27 or exclude themselves from the settlement;

28       (d) October 28, 2019: Filing of Plaintiffs' Motion for Award of

Attorneys' Fees and Costs;

(e) November 25, 2019: Deadline to file Class Members' Objections to any aspect of the Settlement (including Plaintiffs' Motion for Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs): Must be postmarked or received by that date;

(f) November 25, 2019: Deadline to opt-out: Must be postmarked or received by that date;

(g) November 25, 2019: Deadline to file class claims: Must be postmarked or received by that date;

(h) December 16, 2019: Deadline to file Opposition or Reply to Objections (including to objections to award of attorneys' fees and costs);

(i) December 16, 2019: Deadline to file proposed final approval order and motion for final approval of settlement;

(j) January 13, 2020: Final Approval hearing.

4. In the event that the class notice is not communicated through text message, email and regular mail by September 23, the subsequent dates contained herein will be deferred for the number of additional days before such notice occurs without the need for additional Court approval. However, the Court must approve any change of the date of the Final Approval Hearing.

5. If the number of Opt Outs amounts to more than three, Defendants shall have the option of withdrawing from the settlement.

6. Class members have been identified exclusively from Los Angeles Police Department arrest records Damages Class.

### **III. CLASS ADMINISTRATOR**

7. The Court approves Carol Sobel to act as the Class Administrator in order to minimize the cost of class administration, as her office has been in contact with many class members, and this amount is meaningfully less than what would

1 likely be paid to a professional administrator. Ms. Sobel's office has performed  
2 this service in other cases before the District Court and has assisted in maximizing  
3 class participation in other cases where an outside firm was retained to administer  
4 the class fund.

5 8. The Class Administrator shall preserve all written communications  
6 from Class Members in response to the Class and Settlement Notice at least until  
7 December 31, 2022, or pursuant to further order of the Court. All written  
8 communications received by the Class Administrator from Class Members relating  
9 to the Settlement Agreement shall be available at all reasonable times for  
10 inspection and copying by Counsel for the Parties, and copies shall be regularly  
11 provided to Counsel for the Parties.

12 9. The Class Administrator shall be compensated in the amount of  
13 \$20,000 from the Class Damages Fund for services in connection with notice and  
14 administration, which amount includes the costs of giving mailed and published  
15 notice, and the other class administration services to be performed, pursuant to  
16 such orders as the Court may enter from time to time.

17 10. Within two weeks after this Preliminary Approval Order is signed by  
18 the Court, the City of Los Angeles shall deposit or cause to be deposited into an  
19 account designated by the Class Administrator by check sent by overnight mail an  
20 amount of same day available funds equal to \$20,000. If the Court does not enter  
21 the Final Order of Approval and Settlement, then all such funds paid to the Class  
22 Administrator, to the extent they are available after payment of all accrued class  
23 administration expenses, shall be returned to Defendants.

24 11. If the settlement is not approved or otherwise does not occur, the case  
25 proceeds to trial and judgment, and the plaintiffs are successful, plaintiffs shall  
26 seek as awardable costs under any available legal theory class administration costs  
27 incurred in the course of this settlement process, and any future or additional class  
28 administration funds incurred in connection with the case (as well as any other

costs the plaintiffs deem appropriate).

#### **IV. CLASS COUNSEL**

12. Barrett S. Litt, Carol Sobel and Paul Hoffman are hereby confirmed as counsel for the Class Representatives and the Class (“Class Counsel”).

13. Class Counsel are authorized to act on behalf of the Class with respect to all acts or consents required by or which may be given pursuant to the Settlement, and such other acts reasonably necessary to consummate the Settlement.

#### **V. CLASS AND SETTLEMENT NOTICE**

14. Class Counsel shall provide the Class and Settlement Notice to the Class Administrator for distribution according to the schedule set forth above. Such notice shall be in substantially the form as proposed in Exhibit B to the Settlement Agreement and shall be communicated as provided in ¶ 3(b) and (c) above (providing for both text message, email and regular mail notice); returned mail shall be subject to follow up mailings after appropriate searches of the available databases. No notice by publication shall be required because such notice has not proven effective at reaching class members, and the resources are better spent on attempting to reach class members through electronic email and other means of electronic outreach. See revisions to F.R.Civ.P 23 (c)(2)(B) effective December 2019 (acknowledging that notice “may be by ... electronic means, or other appropriate means” in addition to or in lieu of United States mail).

15. Defendants represent that they have already provided the name, address and other identifying information of Class Members to Plaintiffs’ counsel. Such information shall be confidential and may not be disclosed to anyone except counsel of record, the Class Administrator, and designated representatives of Defendants. Should the Defendants discover at any time any additional information containing relevant class information, they shall promptly provide it to Plaintiffs’ counsel and the Class Administrator.

1           16. At least seven days before the Fairness Hearing, Class Counsel and/or  
2 the Class Administrator shall serve and file a sworn statement by the Class  
3 Administrator attesting to compliance with the provisions of this Order governing  
4 Class and Settlement Notice. This shall include a list of all people who have opted  
5 out of the class.

6           17. The Court approves the Class and Settlement Notice attached as  
7 Exhibit B.

8           18. The Court approves the Claim Form attached as Exhibit C.

9           19. The Court finds that the notice required by the foregoing provisions of  
10 this Order is the best notice practicable under the circumstances and shall  
11 constitute due and sufficient notice of the Settlement and the Fairness Hearing to  
12 all Class Members and other persons affected by and/or entitled to participate in  
13 the settlement, in full compliance with the notice requirements of Rule 23 Federal  
14 Rules of Civil Procedure and due process.

## 15 **VI. THE FAIRNESS HEARING**

16           20. A Fairness Hearing shall be held on December 16, 2019, to consider:  
17 (a) the fairness, reasonableness, and adequacy of the Settlement; (b) whether a  
18 Final Order of Approval and Settlement should be entered in its current or some  
19 modified form; and (c) the application by Class Counsel for attorneys' fees and  
20 expenses (the "Fee Motion").

21           21. Prior to the Fairness Hearing, Plaintiffs shall submit a proposed Final  
22 Approval Order, which shall be approved by Defendants. That proposed order will  
23 contain the final provisions the Parties seek the Court to finally approve and the  
24 Parties' proposed court orders related to any objections that have been filed. It will  
25 not be necessary to file a separate motion for final approval.

26           22. The date and time of the Fairness Hearing shall be set forth in the  
27 Class and Settlement Notice but shall be subject to adjournment by the Court  
28 without further notice to the Class Members other than that which may be posted



1 at the Court and on the Court's web site.

2 23. Any Class Member who objects to the approval of the Settlement  
3 Agreement, the Fee Motion, the Named Plaintiffs' incentive awards or the  
4 proposed allocation of damages among class members may appear at the Fairness  
5 Hearing and show cause why any one of the foregoing should not be approved as  
6 fair, reasonable, and adequate, and why the Final Order of Approval and  
7 Settlement should not be entered, except that no such Class Member may appear at  
8 the Fairness Hearing unless the Class Member, no later than November 4, 2019  
9 [the date to file objections to the Settlement] (a) files with the Clerk of the Court a  
10 notice of such person's intention to appear, a statement that indicates the basis and  
11 grounds for such person's objection to the Settlement Agreement, the Fee Petition,  
12 the Named Plaintiffs' incentive awards or the proposed allocation of damages  
13 among class members, and all documentation, papers, or briefs in support of such  
14 objection; and by the same date (b) serves upon all Counsel to the Parties (as listed  
15 in the Class Notice), either in person or by mail, copies of such notice of intention  
16 to appear, statement of objections and all documentation, papers, or briefs that  
17 such person files with the Court. The required documentation shall include the  
18 information requested on the Claim Form. Final determination of whether any  
19 such objector is a Class Member who has standing to object shall be determined  
20 solely from the Defendants' records, from which the list of Class Members has  
21 been compiled. In the absence of the timely filing and timely service of the notice  
22 of intention to appear and all other materials required by this paragraph, any  
23 objection shall be deemed untimely and denied.

24 24. Pending final approval of the Settlement Agreement, no Class  
25 Member shall, either directly, representatively, or in any other capacity,  
26 commence, prosecute against any Defendant or participate in any action or  
27 proceeding in any court or tribunal asserting any of the matters, claims, or causes  
28 of action that are to be released by the Settlement Agreement upon final approval.

25. In the event of final approval of the Settlement Agreement, all Damages Class Members (except those who have opted out) shall be forever enjoined and barred from asserting any of the matters, claims or causes of action released by the Settlement Agreement, and all such Class Members shall be deemed to have forever released any and all such matters, claims and causes of action as provided for in the Settlement Agreement.

**VII. OTHER PROVISIONS**

26. To the extent not otherwise specifically addressed in this Order, Defendants and Class Counsel shall comply with the provisions of the Settlement Agreement.

27. In the event the Settlement is not finally approved or is otherwise terminated in accordance with the provisions of the Settlement Agreement, the Settlement and all proceedings had in connection therewith shall be null and void, except insofar as expressly provided to the contrary in the Settlement Agreement, and without prejudice to the status quo ante rights of Plaintiffs, Defendants, and Class Members.

DATED: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
JOHN A. KRONSTADT  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

SUBMITTED BY:

**KAYE, McLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT  
LAW OFFICE OF CAROL SOBEL  
SCHONBRUN, SEPLOW, HARRIS & HOFFMAN**

By:     /s/ Barrett S. Litt      
Barrett S. Litt  
Attorneys for Plaintiffs